

ESRC National Centre for

Research
Methods



Innovation in qualitative research methodology: Annotated bibliography

Helen Pain
University of Southampton

December 2009

ESRC National Centre for Research Methods

NCRM Working Paper Series

07/09

Innovation in qualitative research methodology

Annotated bibliography

Introduction

This annotated bibliography forms part of a programme of research on methodological innovation that the Southampton Hub of the ESRC National Centre for Research Methods is undertaking during its 2nd phase of funding (2009-2014). It has been conducted as part of a project aimed at identifying claims for innovation in qualitative research made in the literature.

The remit stated on the websites of peer-reviewed social science journals were read and those with a stated interest in research methodology, excluding those that were exclusively quantitatively focussed, were selected (n=14).

A search across these journals (2000 - 2009) was conducted using *innovat**, *new*, *novel* and *emerg** in title and abstract; 207 articles were identified. Papers in which the key words had not been used in connection with research methods or were not in English or were primarily quantitative were excluded, leaving 57 articles from nine journals (see Appendix 1).

This bibliography contains the 57 papers included in the literature review on innovation described above as well as 13 related papers identified during the process of this project, which include some papers that were borderline and excluded only after review. The bibliography is grouped according to the topics of research methodology identified in the literature and each entry describes the innovation claims made by the authors. The following topic headings are used to organise the bibliography:

- general innovation literature;
- creative methods;
- focus group methodology;
- mixed methods;
- narrative methods;
- online and e-research methods;
- software tools; and
- 'other'.

Some papers cover more than one of the topic headings but where this occurs we have highlighted it.

The symbol ✓ denotes the 57 key articles.

General Innovation Literature

J. Brannen and R. Edwards, 2007. 10th Anniversary editorial. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 10, 1, 1-4.

The authors review the context for research and developments within research in papers published in the *Journal*. Comment is made that innovations are emerging to: facilitate data processing and analysis, especially with the aid of technology; investigate the emotional aspects of a topic; and make greater collaboration an integral part of the methodology.

T. Greenhalgh, G. Robert, F. Macfarlane, et al., 2005. Storylines of research in diffusion of innovation: a meta-narrative approach to systematic review. *Social Science & Medicine* 61, 2, 417-430.

The authors used narrative reasoning in their approach to a systematic literature review of diffusion of innovations. They developed (adapted) the narrative literature review method to examine the paradigms behind a number of examples of innovation diffusion, including evidence-based medicine. Their approach is termed *meta-narrative review* and embraces pragmatism, pluralism, historicity and contestation. Their results showed that for each example there are different factors which consequently affect the way in which diffusion occurs. The authors conclude that 'where the scope of a project is broad and the literature diverse' (p429) meta-narrative review is a useful approach to synthesise the data, but state that further refinement of the method will be undertaken.

G. Gwyther and A. Possamai-Inesedy, 2009. Methodologies a la carte: an examination of emerging qualitative methodologies in social research. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 12, 2, 99-115.

This is part of a special issue on methodological innovations and commences with a dramatic interlude. The authors then examine the new methodologies movement from an historical context, funding perspective, and as part of the wider arena of Australian socio-political life over the past decade. Auto-ethnography and some of the methods involved in arts-based social inquiry are discussed, and the authors conclude that utilisation of the arts within research can facilitate communicating knowledge in a more holistic way and give voice to the oppressed.

C. Taylor and A. Coffey, 2008. Innovation in qualitative research methods: possibilities and challenges. Working paper 121, Cardiff University, UK. Accessed at

<http://www.cardiff.ac.uk/socsi/research/publications/workingpapers/papers-121-130.html> on 30/11/2009.

This paper focuses on innovation in qualitative research methods, and addresses the questions of how innovation and their diffusion might be defined. A framework is proposed, that includes the stages of the diffusion

process and the benefits of the innovation in addition to categories that locate the innovation within research methodology.

M. Travers, 2009. New methods, old problems: A sceptical view of innovation in qualitative research. *Qualitative Research* 9, 2, 161-179.

This article considers how social theorists have understood the issue of 'newness' and the pursuit of innovation as a cultural problem. It explores the issue in qualitative research through examining how researchers accomplish and recognize 'newness' in the texts they read and produce.

M. Xenitidou and N. Gilbert, 2009. Innovations in social science research methods. ESRC National Centre for Research Methods Report, University of Surrey. Accessed at <http://eprints.ncrm.ac.uk/804/> on 22/12/2009.

This study was undertaken to identify globally (excepting the UK) the people or institutions that were most actively innovating with regard to social science research methodology. The authors searched online databases and portals, then identified key people (n=36) who were interviewed regarding innovative methodologies; an email survey was also conducted with a further 215. An additional 40 experts nominated through this process were interviewed by email, Skype or telephone. From the data, the authors categorised the innovations into technological, interdisciplinary or intra-disciplinary innovations, and describe 34 developments of which 10 are qualitative, 12 quantitative and 12 mixed methods. The innovative activity was located mainly in the US, Europe and Canada.

Creative methods

- ✓ V. Borum, 2006. Reading and writing womanist poetic prose - African American mothers with deaf daughters. *Qualitative Inquiry* 12, 2, 340-352.
Womanism (Black feminism) was the researcher's philosophical basis in the context of interviews with Black women who cared for a deaf child. Poetic prose is used to present findings, and Borum describes an interactive process with participants to achieve a combination of interview excerpts to convey their experience faithfully. Borum claims the application of poetic prose to womanist research as innovative.

- S. Dexter and D. R. LaMagdeleine, 2002. Dominance Theater, Slam-a-Thon, and Cargo Cults: Three Illustrations of How Using Conceptual Metaphors in Qualitative Research Works. *Qualitative Inquiry* 8, 3, 362-380.
Metaphors have been utilised in reporting research, but little has been written about their use within the research process. Using three case examples, metaphor as a conceptual tool to guide data analysis is described, together with its advantages and limitations.

- ✓ Doornbos, M. van Rooij, M. Smit, et al., 2008. From Fairytales to Sphercards: Towards a New Research Methodology for Improving Knowledge Productivity. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9, 2, Art.48.
 To address the theory-practice divide, acknowledge the aesthetic aspects of a topic, promote application of research to practice and find methods with which both practitioners and researchers can engage, the authors propose a cycle of learning that connects research and practitioners at every stage. Eight 'arts-based' techniques are described to illustrate its stages. Both the practitioner-research focus and the creative techniques are described as innovative.
- ✓ R. Furman, C. Lietz and C. L. Langer, 2006. The Research Poem in International Social Work: Innovations in Qualitative Methodology. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 5, 3, 24-34.
 The authors state that social workers need affective as well as cognitive knowledge of their clients' context, and arts-based methods have the potential to achieve this. Poetry is a medium that may be used to present findings, as raw data, or as a technique to assist analysis. An example is given to demonstrate this: two poems written by the first author were analysed inductively then two kinds of *research poem* constructed for each, a tanka and a pantoum. Use of poetry to present findings is an example of an emerging format, but use of poems as data and as an analysis technique is novel.
- ✓ N. Glass, 2008. Interrogating the Conventional Boundaries of Research Methods in Social Sciences: The Role of Visual Representation in Ethnography. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9, 2, Art.50.
 Glass states that art interacts with viewers in a dynamic way; that art can convey the emotional aspects better than words alone; and that the process can be transformative. She conducted an ethnographical study of professional development in academic nursing professionals in five countries, using art-based and written reflections by the author during participant observation and interviews. This art, together with text, was exhibited to disseminate the findings. Glass cites viewers' comments to underline the potential of the art to be transformative for them, as well as for the researcher and participants. She implies a claim to add to the literature on this innovative use of art.
- ✓ E. Gotschi, R. Delve and B. Freyer, 2009. Participatory Photography as a Qualitative Approach to Obtain Insights into Farmer Groups. *Field Methods* 21, 3, 290-308.
 Three groups of farmers in a developing country already known to the researcher were recruited to explore the way in which groups organise themselves and function. Disposable cameras were given to the group as a whole; later to pairs of individuals from each group; then to the group as a

whole again. Discussions were held in a progressive manner as pictures were developed. The method was adapted for one group because they wanted all group members photographed. The method proved effective in demonstrating the value of their groups to the farmers and the social capital and dynamics of the groups to the researcher. Participatory photography is well established but working with groups rather than individuals and the progressive steps in the method with the groups are claimed as novel.

- ✓ P. Mason, 2005. Visual Data in Applied Qualitative Research: Lessons from Experience. *Qualitative Research* 5, 3, 325-346.
Five projects within a broad health-related community development programme were recorded and evaluated through the use of video and photography. Mason considers this approach to evaluation has potential provided the following recommendations are heeded: both research and media skills should be present, the context for the visual data is always recorded, and community members are given instruction and support to enable their participation. He claims the method is new because there have been no reports in the literature of the use of visual methods in the evaluation of policy or services.
- ✓ C. McLaren, 2009. Analyzing Qualitative Data about Hospitalized Children: Reflections on Bodily Expressions. *The Qualitative Report* 14, 1, 140-154.
As part of an evaluation of an atrium in a paediatric hospital, in which interviews provided the main data, 80 children each had a tour of the area with the author to take photographs of what interested them. McLaren noticed how they moved through the space and reacted to it, so included this data in her analysis, using several theoretical stances to inform this process. Although tentative with her claims to innovation, the integration of 'kinetic conversation' (p142) data into this project was an innovation, and she invites further developments in this area.
- ✓ C. F. Pevey and N. J. McKenzie, 2009. Love, Fear, and Loathing: A Qualitative Examination of Christian Perceptions of Muslims. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 10, 1, Art.1.
The authors considered that a questionnaire (PEW Survey) about Christian attitudes to Islam would not tap respondents' feelings, especially when these conflicted with their conscious attitude. Metaphors 'reflect the way individuals think and live' (para.10) and were therefore used with a sample of 20 self-identified Christians. The *Zaltman Metaphor Elicitation Technique* was adapted: each respondent was asked to select objects from a box and explain the reasons for their selections; then select a taste, texture and emotion from displays, as metaphors to express their feelings about Muslims. The interviews were recorded, transcribed and the metaphors identified and analysed. The authors describe this method as inventive, and conclude that the method effectively uncovered respondents' feelings,

especially those that were socially unacceptable or conflicted with expressed attitudes or beliefs.

- ✓ C. J. S. Picart and K. Gergen, 2004. Dharma dancing: Ballroom dancing and the relational order. *Qualitative Inquiry* 10, 6, 836-868.
The authors use photograph and video images, together with poetic captioning, to convey creatively an ethnographic account of relatedness and communication. After a written introduction, the remainder of the article is entirely Figures. This re-presentation style is termed an extension of 'Denzin's innovations in ethnography'.
- ✓ F. Rapport, 2008. The Poetry of Holocaust Survivor Testimony: Towards a New Performative Social Science. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9, 2, Art.28.
Rapport interviewed Holocaust survivors and presents the findings from one of the respondents in the form of poetry with photographic images, in order to more fully express the intensity of the person's experience. The images were of both the respondent and the researcher's visit to Auschwitz, and the poetry was written using many of the respondents' words to retain her 'voice'. Rapport claims that the poetic form is firmly embedded in social science but is adding to the literature on 'advances' in qualitative research methods.
- ✓ J. C. Richards, 2006. Post Modern Image-Based Research: An Innovative Data Collection Method for Illuminating Preservice Teachers Developing Perceptions in Field-Based Courses. *The Qualitative Report* 11, 1, 37-54.
Twenty-eight student teachers drew a self-portrait with speech bubble at six points across a period of teaching practice. These were analysed for content and then compared cross-sectionally and longitudinally. Analyses were corroborated through use of the author's field notes, student 'journal' entries (which were written for the author) and teaching cases. The data were effective at showing development in knowledge, skills and confidence, and useful for evaluation of course delivery. The methodology of using drawings as longitudinal data is claimed as innovative, at least within education.
- ✓ J. Saldana, 2003. Dramatizing data: A primer. *Qualitative Inquiry* 9, 2, 218-236.
Saldana describes ethnodrama as the researcher 'playwrit[ing] with data' (p.219). Ethnodrama should be used only when the findings of an ethnographic study are considered to lend themselves to dramatisation, but the author considers little has been published on the process involved. He therefore describes the process of compiling a plot, condensing the data, deciding on characters and using the visual to enhance the storyline and characters. Collaboration between the ethnographer and theatre artistes is stated as vital to produce an entertaining and informative performance.

- ✓ Simhoni, 2008. *The False Witness: Artistic Research on Stage*. *The Qualitative Report* 13, 3, 353-378.

Simhoni conducted a case study of Krakow's reasons, methods and process in writing 'The False Witness', which is a fictitious trial of Adolf Hitler for his role in the Holocaust. Simhoni interviewed Krakow, examined his research documents, the play, its reviews, and saw a production of it. Krakow had analysed *Mein Kampf* in detail for anti-semitic statements, traced these back to Hitler's sources, read these, and used the setting of a trial to dramatise his findings. Simhoni concludes that dramatic presentation is better than a photographic exhibition because it enables the audience to engage with the ideological issues raised, and that photographs 'dishonor' the Holocaust victims. *Research-based drama* is described as innovative, and this play as an exemplar of the genre.

- ✓ R. Thomson and J. Holland, 2005. 'Thanks for the Memory': Memory Books as a Methodological Resource in Biographical Research. *Qualitative Research* 5, 2, 201-219.

In a three-phase mixed methods longitudinal study of identity construction in teenagers, the compilation of a memory book between two of a series of biographical interviews was requested. The teenagers were asked to make a record of their life over three months using any combination of writing, pictures, photographs and memorabilia. They were given a book, stickers, labels, folder, instructions and disposable camera, and asked to bring the resulting memory book to their next interview. Half did so (n=49), and their books were used as a prompt during the interview. The content of each book was mapped and parts copied in accordance with permission granted by the participant, then the books were returned to them. This method was developed from life story books (for fostered or adopted children) as a way to get deeper than pure narrative and provide a visual method with which the teenagers could engage, and is innovative for biographical research. It proved effective at revealing additional aspects of identity but its uptake was biased towards younger and female respondents.

- ✓ L. Todres and K. T. Galvin, 2008. Embodied interpretation: a novel way of evocatively re-presenting meanings in phenomenological research. *Qualitative Research* 8, 5, 568-583.

The authors introduce *embodied interpretation* which is an approach to a phenomenological study that requires the researcher's reactions and feelings to be used as an instrument of analysis. The presentation of the findings seeks to convey the holistic experience through evocative language, rather than focusing on descriptions alone. It is the greater use of the researcher's reactions and feelings in analysis and the intentional use of evocative language that are claimed as innovative. The theoretical underpinning is discussed, the approach described and a worked example provided in which the authors additionally present a more traditional

description and suggest that the two together will be more effective and meaningful communicators than either alone.

Focus group methodology

- ✓ L. Dodson, D. Piatelli and L. Schmalzbauer, 2007. Researching inequality - Through interpretive collaborations shifting power and the unspoken contract. *Qualitative Inquiry* 13, 6, 821-843.

From a standpoint of feminist participatory research, the authors raise the effects of power differentials and participant vulnerability on the gathering and interpretation of the data. They then describe *Interpretive Focus Groups* as a way to collaboratively analyse data by convening people from a similar background as the research analysts. The researchers presented excerpts from raw data and initial analyses to the groups for discussion. The ethics, risks involved and benefits from this approach are aired. The first author developed the method 'over 15 years ago' but the earliest publication cited is 1998.
- ✓ E. R. Peterson and K. A. Barron, 2007. How to Get Focus Groups Talking: New Ideas that will Stick. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 6, 3, 140-144.

The authors experienced difficulty in getting teenage students to discuss topics, and in getting quiet members to express their views. 'Stickies' (e.g. Post-it notes) were introduced so that each participant could write their contribution down; these were displayed, meanings checked, and the participants then asked to arrange the stickies according to the purpose that the researcher explained. Relationships between groups of stickies were then discussed, drawn, amended. The authors claim that, outside business settings, the technique is novel and has been successful in improving participation.
- ✓ M. Zuckerman-Parker and G. Shank, 2008. The Town Hall Focus Group: A New Format for Qualitative Research Methods. *The Qualitative Report* 13, 4, 630-635.

The authors wished to convene four focus groups to discuss professional development training for maths and science teachers. All opted for the same date, and due to circumstances only one researcher was available. The participants were encouraged to sit in groups, and after introductions from the whole group, acted together within their informal group. The researcher ensured each informal group provided input and found it worked well, and consensus was built as the session proceeded. Before finishing, each person was given the opportunity to raise any issue not discussed. The authors conclude that this novel way of managing a large group is effective, provided the topic is not sensitive.

See also Grim et al, 2006 in the 'Mixed Methods' section, and Turney and Pocknee, 2005 in the 'Online and e-research methods' section.

Mixed methods

- ✓ G. Bessell, M. C. Burke, M. P. Plaza, et al., 2008. The Educational Reform Rating Rubric: Example of a new tool for evaluating complex school reform initiatives. *Field Methods* 20, 3, 283-295.

A large-scale evaluation of schools following a US reform initiative necessitated handling a large amount of quantitative and qualitative data. The *Educational Reform Rating Rubric* was developed as a tool to enable different kinds of data to be summarised in rating scales, under seven indicators developed from extensive literature reviews and team discussion. Reliability and validity are reported as good for this new tool, but its application is primarily for comparisons (of a school's progress, or across a reform programme) as it is not a standardised measure.
 - ✓ Cronk, L, Gerkey D and Irons, W 2009. Interviews and experiments: using audience effects to examine social relationships. *Field methods*, 21,4, 331-346

Eighty people were interviewed in the Bay Islands about parenting; one question related to adult children's obligations to support elderly parents. Each participant was interviewed only once: 44 in individual interviews (22 of each generation) and 18 in joint interviews with one of their parents. Forcefulness of communication was coded into a 5 point scale, ratings for 'vocalics' and length of response noted, and these, together with other variables were analysed using statistical modelling. Another question's responses were used as a control. Some effect of the presence of the parent or child in interview was detected. The use of 'audience effects' is proposed as a 'new tool for ethnographic research'.
 - ✓ Fielding, N and Cisneros-Puebla, C. 2009. CAQDAS-GIS convergence toward a new integrated mixed method research practice? *J mixed methods research*, 3, 4, 349-370

The authors argue that qualitative geography and qualitative social science (where it is spatial) are converging: philosophically, methodologically and practically. Geographic Information Systems (GIS) have been developed to enable the incorporation of qualitative data, and CAQDAS has been developed to link with geographical sources such as Google Earth and maps, so the technology is converging too. A study is described where adolescents compiled information about places they did or did not frequent on a map, which was then integrated with the focus group data and analysed together. This approach is termed new, although prior examples of it are cited.
- J. Glaesser, 2008. Just How Flexible Is the German Selective Secondary School System? A Configurational Analysis. *International Journal of Research & Method in Education* 31, 2, 193-209.
- Qualitative Comparative Analysis* was developed in political science with small data sets; Glaesser shows how it can be used on large data sets within education. QCA uses Boolean logic to demonstrate whether the

presence or absence of independent variable(s) affect outcome. This allows for combinations of linked variables to be tested for their combined effect on the outcome, using bespoke software.

- ✓ B. J. Grim, A. H. Harmon and J. C. Gromis, 2006. Focused Group Interviews As an Innovative Quanti-Qualitative Methodology (QQM): Integrating Quantitative Elements into a Qualitative Methodology. *The Qualitative Report* 11, 3, 516-537.
The authors describe the use of quantitative methods within focus group methodology, as one way to bridge the divide between quantitative and qualitative methods. The investigation into the use and efficacy of health information sheets included a short questionnaire to collect respondents' key variables and individual response sheets for a practical exercise, as well as group discussion. This *quanti-qualitative methodology* (QQM) is claimed as an innovative method that is particularly useful where qualitative methods are used for hypothesis testing, and that it can make the qualitative results 'more empirically transparent'.

- J. Harloff, 2005. Multiple Level Weighted Card Sorting Methodology: *European Journal of Research Methods for the Behavioral and Social Sciences* 1, 4, 119-128.
Harloff criticises card sorting for its restriction on expressing the different possible cognitive hierarchies that people have of the topic. His method asks people to sort twice: once according to similarity; once to place the groups on a hierarchy ('edge weighting'). Mathematical calculations are used to produce matrices from which dendrograms can be constructed (using software). This variant of card sorting is described as new.

- ✓ T. Koenig, 2006. Compounding Mixed-Methods Problems in Frame Analysis through Comparative Research. *Qualitative Research* 6, 1, 61-76.
In the context of textual data from the media, the author describes a process for *Frame Analysis*, introducing a 'four-step program' which employs both qualitative and quantitative methods. *Detection of frames*: the author argues that the master frames already identified within media studies should be used to structure the analysis, but within that to analyse inductively. *Concept Mapping* was done using special software which uses linguistic algorithms, then the results compared with those from the first stage, and amendments made as necessary to the frames. *Coding* employed keyword strings (that define the frames identified) to code all the data into the frames, using CAQDAS. *Validation* was achieved by using Latent Class Analysis on the coding to statistically demonstrate trends in the frames across the data. The challenges that multi-lingual comparisons brought is also discussed. The four-step program is an innovative bringing together and expansion of previous methods of Frame Analysis.

- ✓ S. Lockyer, 2006. Heard the One about...Applying Mixed Methods in Humour Research? *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 9, 1, 41-59.

Comic offence caused by Private Eye was explored using several published sources, plus interviews with some of the publication's staff. A mixed methods approach was used for analysis: quantitative content analysis to identify the broad patterns of complaint and the libel cases; linguistic discourse analysis and symbolic cultural analysis to explore the ways in which the offence was presented and defended; qualitative textual analysis of the libel case reports; qualitative composition analysis of the Letters Page layout. The combination of qualitative and quantitative methods is claimed as innovative in the study of the ethics of humour.

- ✓ D. J. Pauleen and P. Yoong, 2004. Studying Human-Centered IT Innovation Using a Grounded Action Learning Approach. *Qualitative Report* 9, 1, 137-160.

The authors describe the grounded action learning approach, a method that combines action learning with grounded theory and is a development of grounded action research described in 1999. A study was undertaken to explore how a virtual team (VT) facilitator builds relationships within the team, and also to provide a learning experience for the VT facilitators who participated. The VT facilitator training was led by their needs, an action learning approach; the data recorded during this course were analysed using a grounded theory approach. The benefits of combining these methods are listed as allowing participants to learn, practice and reflect, and enabling theories to be developed concerning the functioning of VT facilitators. The authors recommend the method for organisations introducing other emergent technologies.
- ✓ F. Rapport, M. A. Doel and P. Wainwright, 2008. The Doctor's Tale: Enacted Workspace and the General Practitioner. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9, 2, Art.2.

A two-phase research project to explore the connections between GPs' workspace and their practice is described. Phase 1 comprised 12 GPs taking 5 photographs of their workspace and writing a two-page 'biography' about their surgery. These were analysed by the researchers using inter-textual analysis of the two types of data. Eight of the original sample agreed to follow-up interviews (phase 2) in which their phase 1 submissions were discussed. These data were analysed using the sententious approach (van Manen) and presented as a frame narrative. The topic and the research methodology are presented as novel.
- ✓ Tsoukalas, 2006. A Method for Studying Social Representations. *Quality and Quantity* 40, 6, 959-981.

Social representations are complex phenomena but are essentially an expression of group thinking that can denote group membership. Tsoukalas provides some theoretical background, and presents the *Representational Survey* as a new tool to explore social representations. The instrument first asks for free associations with a core word, then the respondent has to group these, explain the groupings, rank the words, then indicate words that

are intrinsic to the core (eidetic reduction). This process reveals the main features, the concepts and the associated semantic field of the core word. This instrument draws a number of techniques together in a unique way, and Tsoukalas suggests other research areas in which it could be used.

See also Sade-Beck, 2004 in the 'Online and e-research methods' section.

Narrative methods

- ✓ T. M. Bakker, 2009. Reflections on the Local and the Global in Psychology: Innovation, Liberation and Testimonio. *The Qualitative Report* 14, 2, 201-226.
A counselling and psychology department in South Africa was split and transferred to institutions that imposed the western culture of international competition rather than the culturally relevant model the department had developed. Bakker conducted interviews and focus groups with staff and former students of the original department to record its philosophy, culture and achievements. She theorises that the original department's approach was now like an oppressed culture so used *Testimonio*, a narrative that maintains the voice of the oppressed in a dominant culture, to convey the findings. The use of multiple voices rather than a single voice was claimed as the innovative feature of this comparatively new approach to presentation of research findings.
- ✓ Doucet and N. S. Mauthner, 2008. What can be known and how? Narrated subjects and the Listening Guide. *Qualitative Research* 8, 3, 399-409.
The authors argue that disparity between the 'situated' and 'constituted' conceptualisations of the narrator can be brought together in the concept of the narrated subject. The authors present a version of the *Listening Guide* (Brown 1998) with four readings: Reflexive reading; focus on narrator or subject; focus on social networks and relations; focus on power relations and dominant ideologies. This analytic tool is proposed as a way to discern the narrated subject's multiple layers of interpretation. The adaptation of the Listening Guide is substantial.
- ✓ M. Duncan, 2004. Autoethnography: Critical Appreciation of an Emerging Art. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 3, 4, 28-39.
Using her research across six years of developing hypermedia learning tools as an example, the author tackles criticism of auto-ethnography with regard to its appropriateness, validity and scholarship. The article aims to provide support for the existing method of auto-ethnography.
- ✓ H. Gavin, 2005. The Social Construction of the Child Sex Offender Explored by Narrative. *Qualitative Report* 10, 3, 395-415.
Gavin used narrative inquiry to explore 20 people's perceptions of sex offenders. Six scenarios connected with sex offenders were compiled from literature and refined by researchers, and participants were asked to

complete them in story form. These were analysed from the theoretical perspective of Dominant and Alternative narratives. Gavin concludes that using narrative inquiry was useful despite the wide variation in richness of data between participants, and claims that the use of narrative inquiry is novel in the study of offenders.

- ✓ C. Howitt & Venville, G. 2009. Dual vision: Capturing the learning journey of pre-service early childhood teachers of science. *Int J Research & Method in Education*, 32, 2, 209-230.

The authors combine a reflective approach with an antideficit model (that builds on prior experience and knowledge) to explore a trainee teacher's learning during a science course. The method provided more context for the study of the learning experience than interviews alone (p211) and comprised a series of interviews after training workshops in which critical incidents were identified and discussed, followed by a reflective cycle of reviews of the researcher's written vignettes of the incidents. Different ways of presenting the vignette were used, such as layout, font, and literary style. This adaptation of critical incident review combined with reflective cycles between researcher and trainee enabled a fuller understanding of a trainee teacher's learning experience. The authors call the method 'dual vision' and describe it as new.

- ✓ L. Kacen, 2002. Supercodes Reflected in Titles Battered Women Accord to Their Life Stories. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 1, 1, 49-60.

Kacen argues that methods of life story analysis all leave the researcher to identify the main storyline and proposes transferring this function by asking the participant to do it. Seven battered women were asked to give titles to their stories immediately after telling them. The titles were analysed as well as the stories, and compared. Kacen concludes that titling is useful to guide analysis or it could be used to triangulate the researcher's analysis, and claims its use with life story interviews is novel, but traces its origin in literary and narrative therapy.

- ✓ D. Mahoney, 2007. Constructing reflexive fieldwork relationships: Narrating my collaborative storytelling methodology. *Qualitative Inquiry* 13, 4, 573-594.

Mahoney was studying intimacy construction so 'experimented' with more personal involvement than is usual in research. He used collaborative co-constructed storytelling and ways of presenting data to incorporate the researcher's voice. Mahoney illustrated his methodology using four stories co-constructed with participants. He discusses issues related to being an out- or insider; researcher reflexivity; openness; boundaries; enabling participants to understand the methodology; and how to present the co-construction in the findings. The article is an example of applying ethnography to a particular study's demands.

- ✓ S. Otto, 2007. Beneath and beyond Truth: Studying Literary Narratives to Research Human Phenomena. *International Journal of Research & Method in Education* 30, 1, 73-87.
 Otto describes the privileged status of the scientific method as indicative of the 'Western need for certainty'. This is contrasted with the arts' ability to provide more than one meaning, a 'logic of discovery' according to Rudner (1966). Her call to use literary narrative as data is justified through this argument about different ways of knowing. Otto's topic was the emergence of the creative self and she develops Bruner's (1985) 'narrative mode of knowing' to look at aspects below the surface of the actual content, using literary narrative as the data. This is termed *novel inquiry* and Otto claims it may 'expand... the current methodological landscape' p.77.
- ✓ V. Tohar, M. Asaf, A. Kainan, et al., 2007. An Alternative Approach for Personal Narrative Interpretation: The Semiotics of Roland Barthes. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 6, 3, 57-70.
 Eleven teacher educators were each asked to relate a story from the outset and middle of their career, plus a recent event. A number of models for narrative analysis are presented, and the criticisms made that they tend to be inflexible, and the individual's persona tends to get lost. Barthes' five analytic 'codes' were used to guide analysis: *hermeneutic code*, looking for questions and doubts about teaching; *semic code*, looking for patterns or themes; *symbolic code*, where pairs of opposites indicate non-explicit ways of thinking; *proairetic code*, examining verbs then grouping them thematically; and *cultural code*, where use of teaching jargon expressed professional power or knowledge. The application of Barthes' method to a series of narrative texts, in the discipline of social sciences, and being able to discern links across cases and time, are claimed as innovative.
- ✓ S. Wall, 2006. An Autoethnography on Learning About Autoethnography. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 5, 2, 146-160.
 Wall reviews autoethnographic literature in the context of her discovery and engagement with it. She terms autoethnography as an emerging method that challenges the traditional scientific view, and considers that it acknowledges the link between the personal and cultural aspects of an autobiography. She offers her account as an example of the genre.

See also Holge-Hazelton, 2002, Secrist et al, 2002 in the 'Online and e-research methods' section, and Rapport et al 2008 in the 'Mixed methods' section.

Online and e-research methods

- ✓ V. Hinchcliffe and H. Gavin, 2009. Social and Virtual Networks: Evaluating Synchronous Online Interviewing Using Instant Messenger. *The Qualitative Report* 14, 2, 318-340.

In a study on social support networks in tertiary education, ten final year university students were interviewed using Instant Messenger about their social networks, and then they answered a questionnaire about the method. They reported it to be a convenient and easy method and that the perceived anonymity encouraged confidence; the first author also was positive as the text was recorded (no transcription was necessary) and exchanges were concise and clear. The medium also removed any disability connected with Hinchcliffe's hearing impairment. Instant Messenger is described as an innovative communication platform for interview-based research.

- ✓ B. Holge-Hazelton, 2002. The Internet: A New Field for Qualitative Inquiry? Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research 3, 2, Art.15.

As part of a study on living with diabetes, the author conducted interviews via email exchanges with 20 young people with diabetes, who were recruited through an invitation posted on a diabetes website. A free-association narrative approach was used, asking them what questions they would ask if researching the lives of young people with diabetes, then inviting them to answer them. The newness of using the internet for research interviewing is implied and the nature of virtual relationships and the implications for research conducted in this environment are discussed.

- ✓ N. Hookway, 2008. 'Entering the blogosphere': some strategies for using blogs in social research. Qualitative Research 8, 1, 91-113.

Hookway argues that although much use of the internet has been made, social researchers have not used blogs as a source of data. Advantages listed include their convenience for participants, the latter's potential unselfconsciousness and the facility to study change over time (due to archiving). How the author accessed the blogosphere for his study on everyday morality is described, comparison made between blogs and diary data, and the issues of copyright and consent are discussed. Hookway considers impression management should not be an issue as the internet gives anonymity, and the incidence of fabrication is likely to be low. The innovation claimed is the change from studying blogs to using blogs as data.

- ✓ J. Matthews and E. P. Cramer, 2008. Using Technology to Enhance Qualitative Research with Hidden Populations. The Qualitative Report 13, 2, 301-315.

The authors describe a study where gay adoptive fathers were recruited to a private (restricted access) internet group, with the rationale that the internet enables 'hidden' populations to be reached across a wide geographical area, and that identity is more easily concealed thus people may participate more readily. The group was used for data collection, to gain feedback on research findings and for members to chat to each other. This approach was viable because a high proportion of gay people, especially men, are known to be internet users. Ethical issues raised by online working are briefly discussed. The use of internet to access 'hidden' populations is

claimed as innovative; the 'technological innovation' of video-conferencing was suggested to add non-verbal data to the verbal, but this was only piloted.

- ✓ L. Sade-Beck, 2004. Internet Ethnography: Online and Offline. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 3, 2, 45-51.

Sade-Beck argues that there should be more integration between the virtual and the real spheres in ethnography, as technology is an increasingly a part of many people's lives. The author undertook a year of online observation in bereavement support groups, and analysed news reports and online documents concerning such groups. A sample of users and group facilitators were then emailed to ask if they were willing to be interviewed face to face to explore the benefits of the online support groups to the individuals. Sade-Beck claims combining online and offline methods is innovative, that it provides richer data and reduces the dichotomy between the study of real and virtual worlds.

- ✓ S. Scott, 2004. Researching Shyness: A Contradiction in Terms? *Qualitative Research* 4, 1, 91-105.

Scott recruited 13 self-defined shy people: two through posters in public places eg GP surgeries, and 11 students through university training courses. These were interviewed, using guidelines for raising sensitive issues. In these, the greater sense of ease when using online communication was voiced, so Scott formed an online discussion group, recruiting from an online forum concerning shyness. The group was 'unmoderated' but Scott participated. She concludes that, given an environment that removes the social consequences that shy people fear, they will become vocal. The claim to innovation is twofold: applying guidelines drawn up for sensitive issues to shy participants; and forming an unmoderated online discussion group for data collection.

M. J. Stern, 2008. The use of client-side paradata in analyzing the effects of visual layout on changing responses in Web surveys. *Field Methods* 20, 4, 377-398.

Paradata, collected automatically as respondents complete online questionnaires, have been used to explore possible reasons for abandonment and to develop respondent typologies, but seldom to explore question quality. Changed answers were examined by the author in scalar questions, mark-all-that-apply questions and large list selection questions. Systematic patterns of changes were used to discern possible causes for the participants' alterations, and three question design recommendations are drawn from the findings. The use of paradata to evaluate question quality is claimed as innovative.

- ✓ L. Turney and C. Pocknee, 2005. Virtual Focus Groups: New Frontiers in Research. *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 4, 2, 32-43.

The authors needed to complement data from traditional focus groups conducted with members of the public, with data from groups of people who had a special interest in the topics. Online sites were used to recruit groups to discuss paternity testing, one from fathers' rights sites and another from single mothers sites, both of which were supplemented through snowballing; a third group discussed stem cell research and was recruited via Parkinson's disease and spinal cord injury online sites. A website was set up for each, linked to a university software facility (Blackboard) that enabled a confidential secure discussion forum. After instruction in, and testing of, the facility by the participants, each group ran for one week with the researcher posting some introductory questions and occasional prompts. The authors conclude that the method was theoretically sound and that its use outside market research was innovative.

- ✓ M. Williams, 2007. Avatar Watching: Participant Observation in Graphical Online Environments. *Qualitative Research* 7, 1, 5-24.
Williams states that literature to date about online participant observation has concerned textual environments. Participant observation in graphical online environments brings additional and different challenges, and some of the differences between textual and graphical online participant observation are described, such as the impact on players of avatar choice and technical skill in manipulating it. Research in this environment is new, and as well as the practical challenges novel ethical issues are raised e.g. regarding consent, due to the presence of public and private spaces in the virtual environment.

Software tools

- ✓ S. Bourdon, 2002. The Integration of Qualitative Data Analysis Software in Research Strategies: Resistances and Possibilities. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 3, 2, Art.11.
The full potential of CAQDAS is often not realised. The author describes how one study used it to facilitate a research team in working together on different analyses yet still benefit from each others' work. After initial coding into themes dictated by the study's data collection tools, each researcher worked on their line of analysis, then their work was merged and nodes compared, discussed and amended or merged as appropriate. Bourdon discusses the potential of CAQDAS in facilitating team collaboration and of enabling analyses that could not be attempted without computer assistance. The way in which the software's capability informed the methodology and expanded the analyses is claimed as innovative.
- ✓ N. Fielding, 2000. The Shared Fate of Two Innovations in Qualitative Methodology: The Relationship of Qualitative Software and Secondary Analysis of Archived Qualitative Data. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 1, 3, Art.22.

Fielding comments on the adoption of CAQDAS in market research and compares this with the social sciences; one of the reasons for slower uptake in social sciences cited was that it was conceptualised as a method not a tool. Uptake of using archived qualitative data for secondary analysis may have been slowed, Fielding argues, if such analyses are usually undertaken by people unlikely to publish their results. He continues by describing how CAQDAS can assist in re-analysis, and outlines reasons why there is limited secondary analysis of archived data, including the small proportion of electronic centrally held data and insufficient details about data context. This article was promoting the diffusion of these technological advances but will now chiefly be of historical interest due to progress since publication.

- ✓ S. Khan and R. VanWynsberghe, 2008. Cultivating the Under-Mined: Cross-Case Analysis As Knowledge Mobilization. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 9, 1, Art.34.
Theoretical support for learning from cross-case comparisons is provided through a review of learning theories (Ausubel; Flyvbjerg; Donmoyer), and several cross-case methodologies are described. The 4C software was developed to foster learning and expertise from case studies, and is a database with functionality that enables researchers to upload their studies under predefined fields; allows searching and selection by field and user-defined tags, displays data according to user selection to assist analysis, and allows communication between users. This database facility is claimed as novel and its benefits for cross-case analyses rehearsed.
- ✓ T. Muhr, 2000. Increasing the Reusability of Qualitative Data with XML. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 1, 3, Art.20.
Muhr discusses some problems with the archiving and re-analysis of qualitative data: vital information could be lost when converting qualitative data to another format, e.g. the detail in transcriptions; and the links and structures made within the data by the software during analysis. A standard structure, such as XML, provides a flexible platform with which other software could interface effectively without loss of information. He promotes the use of the then novel computer language to facilitate sharing of qualitative data and avoid data becoming inaccessible due to obsolete software formats.
- R. J. Quinlan and E. H. Hagen, 2008. New genealogy: It's not just for kinship anymore. *Field Methods* 20, 2, 129-154.
Genealogies have been used in anthropology for over 100 years, but the method is currently under-utilised. The process of interviewing and data verification through use of two or more informants, and free software that facilitates data checking, sorting and analysis, is described. Examples of analyses of reproductive success, marital stability and inheritance issues are provided.

- ✓ C. Secrist, I. de Koeyer, H. Bell, et al., 2002. Combining Digital Video Technology and Narrative Methods for Understanding Infant Development. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 3, 2, Art.24.

The use of Adobe Premier software is described, to assist in the analysis of video footage recorded in a study of mother-infant interactions. Its key advantages are that it assists with storage, organisation and navigation through the data. It does not remove the need for written detailed narratives because these highlight the micro detail, whereas the video clips provide the fuller picture. The software is claimed as a new tool that will be particularly useful in studies that require this attention to both micro-detail and a wider overview; it is not claimed as labour-saving, but the authors state that it enables more time for video viewing and demands less time on writing the narratives, due to the ability to select and organise relevant clips.

Other

- S. P. Borgatti and I. Carboni, 2007. On measuring individual knowledge in organizations. *Organizational Research Methods* 10, 3, 449-462.

A study to compare three approaches to measuring knowledge is presented: Classic test theory (CTT) which assumes there is a right answer, and that respondents who do not know it will guess; Direct subjective ratings (3 variants) which are respondents' ratings of knowledge; and the Consensus model which rests on a derived formula showing that agreement between each pair of respondents is proportionally related to the knowledge of 'correct' answer. The authors used CTT as the standard and found the Consensus model correlated more closely with CTT than the Direct subjective ratings. If the conditions inherent in the Consensus formula are met, this model could be useful for assessing levels of knowledge within organisations, because unlike CTT actual 'correct' answers for the questions are not needed.

- ✓ J. Cho and A. Trent, 2006. Validity in Qualitative Research Revisited. *Qualitative Research* 6, 3, 319-340.

The authors review different approaches to assessing the validity of research. *Transactional* validity measures, used by realist researchers are researcher-led and are aimed at confirming the accuracy of the data. *Transformative* validity measures, used by constructivist researchers, demand reflexivity on part of the researcher or evidence of social change in the participants. *Process* validity requires a reflective record of dilemmas and decisions taken during the research.

The authors propose a holistic approach that encompasses any of the above as epistemologically appropriate, but also includes a record of the rationale behind the approach(es) chosen to provide evidence of validity not just of the data, but of the method, the research output and the outcome for participants. Validity is thus addressed throughout the research and is an

integrated aspect of it. It is this holistic approach that the authors claim is innovative.

M. Dixon-Woods, S. Bonas, A. Booth, et al., 2006. How Can Systematic Reviews Incorporate Qualitative Research? A Critical Perspective. *Qualitative Research* 6, 1, 27-44.

An overview of systematic reviews and influence of Cochrane methodology is presented; a team of eight researchers sought to expand a Cochrane systematic review with qualitative research. Problems with searching, appraisal, sampling and synthesising is described. The authors raise the epistemological mismatch between qualitative research and the Cochrane approaches. *Aggregative* and *interpretive* syntheses and their new approach *Critical Interpretive Synthesis* are briefly described.

- ✓ T. Hak, K. van der Veer and R. Ommundsen, 2006. An Application of the Three-Step Test-Interview (TSTI): A Validation Study of the Dutch and Norwegian Versions of the 'Illegal Aliens Scale'. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 9, 3, 215-227.

The *Three-Step Test-Interview* (TSTI) is an interview designed to test the quality of a questionnaire's construction, and is comprised of: uninterrupted think-aloud completion of the questionnaire with the researcher observing the process; a focussed interview to probe the actual completion process; and a semi-structured interview to discuss wider aspects, opinions and comments. It was used with 14 university students testing Norwegian and Dutch translations of a questionnaire on attitudes to illegal immigrants; as well as wording and layout problems, ambiguities regarding questions' intention were uncovered. TSTI was developed by Jansen and Hak (2005).

- ✓ P. Kahn, T. Wareham, R. Young, et al., 2008. Exploring a Practitioner-Based Interpretive Approach to Reviewing Research Literature. *International Journal of Research & Method in Education* 31, 2, 169-180.

A team of university educationalists (academic and practitioners) undertook a literature review of reflective practice, with the aim of including relevance to practitioners throughout the process. Perspectives from practice in addition to a theoretical framework, were intrinsic during the selection, data extraction and synthesis stages. This, together with a search of grey literature and dialogue within the team, were claimed as innovative. The review resulted in changed practice amongst the team.

- ✓ Y. S. Lincoln and E. Gonzalez, 2008. The search for emerging decolonizing methodologies in qualitative research: Further strategies for liberatory and democratic inquiry. *Qualitative Inquiry* 14, 5, 784-805.

Eight dissertations were examined to explore ways in which bi-lingual, cross-cultural data are presented, and how presentations might benefit both cultures equally. Five approaches are described, which included the original

language to different extents. The authors conclude that the strategy for reporting depends on many factors, yet advocated bilingual presentations, that is, using original quotations with translations beside them. The authors' classification of the emerging approaches is an adaptation of an earlier publication of theirs.

- ✓ S. A. Tate, 2007. Foucault, Bakhtin, Ethnomethodology: Accounting for Hybridity in Talk-in-Interaction. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 8, 2, Art.10.

Tate describes *ethnomethodologically inclined discourse analysis* (eda) which she developed whilst analysing conversations with Black women of mixed race. She noted the negotiated nature of identity and the 're-positioning' away from the dominant discourses on race. This is theorised as a blending of Foucault's more static concepts of power discourses and Bakhtin's ideas of dynamic multivocality. The method that Tate developed (eda) uses discourse analysis but draws out how individuals negotiate their identity and challenge dominant ways of thinking.

- ✓ J. A. Wasserman, J. M. Clair and K. L. Wilson, 2009. Problematics of grounded theory: innovations for developing an increasingly rigorous qualitative method. *Qualitative Research* 9, 3, 355-381.

The authors argue that in current descriptions of grounded theory analysis the progression from initial coding to conceptual and thematic coding is not transparent. The fractal principle of repeated patterns is proposed as a guide, and a model of human cognition (Multilevel Integrated Cognition, MIC) is used as an illustration of the application of a fractal 'generator' to the analysis of data from homeless people. How the generator was applied to the initial coding and to the more thematic codes is described. This *Fractal Concept Analysis* (FCA) is presented as a novel guide to elucidate the concept and theme-making process, enable a more thorough understanding of the data and enhance the trustworthiness of the findings.

- ✓ S. Weller, 2006. Tuning-in to teenagers! Using radio phone-in discussions in research with young people. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology: Theory & Practice* 9, 4, 303-315.

In a study of teenagers' experience of citizenship on the Isle of Wight, Weller used several methods, including a radio phone-in. The idea for the latter came from a group of teenagers in a secondary school, with whom Weller was working in depth. Two from this group acted as guest interviewers, for a single phone-in that was publicised in every secondary school on the island. The ethical considerations are discussed, together with the difficulties experienced regarding adult dominance amongst callers, and the multiple agendas evident during the show between the presenter, the teenagers and the researcher. This situation may have been ameliorated through additional discussion with the radio station beforehand. The approach is described as innovative.

Appendix 1

Source Journals and article capture

Journal	Initial capture	Core selection
Qualitative Research	25	10
Qualitative Inquiry	44	6
Methodology: European Journal of Research Methods for the Behavioural and Social Sciences	1	0
International Journal of Research and Method in Education	7	3
International Journal of Social Research Methodology	14	3
Journal of Mixed Methods Research	6	1
The Qualitative Report	17	10
International Journal of Qualitative Methods	11	8
Forum: Qualitative Social Research	56	12
Quality and Quantity – International Journal of Methodology	3	1
Organizational Research Methods	5	0
Cultural Studies – Critical Methodologies	8	0
Field Methods	8	3
Methodological Innovations Online	2	0
Totals	204	57

Notes

Initial selection was the number of hits recorded in the literature search, without duplicates.

Core selection comprises those that fit the criteria.